



BOARD OF DIRECTORS
CLIMATE PROTECTION COMMITTEE
COMMITTEE MEMBERS

**BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT**

JOHN AVALOS - CHAIR
TERESA BARRETT
JOHN GIOIA
KATIE RICE
SHIRLEE ZANE

JAN PEPPER - VICE CHAIR
CINDY CHAVEZ
SCOTT HAGGERTY
MARK ROSS

**THURSDAY
MARCH 19, 2015
9:30 A.M.**

**7th FLOOR BOARD ROOM
939 ELLIS STREET
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109**

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

(Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items Pursuant to Government Code § 54954.3) Members of the public are afforded the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for regular meetings are posted at Air District headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA, at least 72 hours in advance of a regular meeting. At the beginning of the regular meeting agenda, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Committee's subject matter jurisdiction. Speakers will be limited to three (3) minutes each.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JANUARY 15, 2015 Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Committee will consider approving the attached draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of January 15, 2015.

4. AIR DISTRICT CLIMATE PROTECTION PROGRAM STAFFING AND ACTIVITIES

J. Roggenkamp/4646
jroggenkamp@baaqmd.gov

Staff will brief the Committee on recent organizational changes affecting the Air District's Climate Protection Program and provide an update on current climate protection activities.

5. AIR RESOURCES BOARD CLIMATE PROTECTION PROGRAM

J. Roggenkamp/4646
jroggenkamp@baaqmd.gov

Air Resources Board staff will brief the Committee on the statewide Cap and Trade Program and other Air Resources Board climate protection activities.

6. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

Any member of the Board, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

7. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Thursday, May 21, 2015, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

8. ADJOURNMENT

The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Committee Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109
mmartinez@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-5016
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the "Members of the Climate Protection Committee" and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Committee meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Committee at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities notification to the Clerk's Office should be given in a timely manner, so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109
FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-5016 or (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

MARCH 2015

| <u>TYPE OF MEETING</u> | <u>DAY</u> | <u>DATE</u> | <u>TIME</u> | <u>ROOM</u> |
|--|------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i> | Wednesday | 18 | 9:45 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Thursday of Every Other Month)</i> | Thursday | 19 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i> | Wednesday | 25 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Thursday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED | Thursday | 26 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Legislative Committee <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i> | Monday | 30 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |

APRIL 2015

| <u>TYPE OF MEETING</u> | <u>DAY</u> | <u>DATE</u> | <u>TIME</u> | <u>ROOM</u> |
|--|------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i> | Wednesday | 1 | 9:45 a.m. | Board Room |
| Advisory Council Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 2nd Wednesday of each Month)</i> | Wednesday | 8 | 9:00 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i> | Wednesday | 15 | 9:45 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Executive Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month)</i> | Monday | 20 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month)</i> | Monday | 20 | 10:30 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i> | Wednesday | 22 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Thursday of each Month)</i> | Thursday | 23 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |

MAY 2015

| <u>TYPE OF MEETING</u> | <u>DAY</u> | <u>DATE</u> | <u>TIME</u> | <u>ROOM</u> |
|--|------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i> | Wednesday | 6 | 9:45 a.m. | Board Room |
| Advisory Council Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 2nd Wednesday of each Month)</i> | Wednesday | 13 | 9:00 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Executive Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month)</i> | Monday | 18 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month)</i> | Monday | 18 | 10:30 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i> | Wednesday | 20 | 9:45 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Thursday of Every Other Month)</i> | Thursday | 21 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i> | Wednesday | 27 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |
| Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Thursday of each Month)</i> | Thursday | 28 | 9:30 a.m. | Board Room |

HL – 3/12/15 (11:40 a.m.)

P/Library/Forms/Calendars/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Avalos and Members
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer

Date: March 5, 2015

Re: Approval of the Minutes of January 15, 2015

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve attached draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of January 15, 2015.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of January 15, 2015.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sean Gallagher
Reviewed by: Maricela Martinez

Attachment: Draft Minutes of the Climate Protection Meeting of January 15, 2015

Draft Minutes – Climate Protection Committee Meeting of January 15, 2015

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Climate Protection Committee Meeting
Thursday, January 15, 2015

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Climate Protection Committee (Committee) Chairperson John Avalos called the meeting to order at 9:42 a.m.

Present: Committee Chairperson John Avalos; and Directors Teresa Barrett, Scott Haggerty, Jan Pepper and Mark Ross.

Absent: Directors John Gioia and Shirlee Zane.

Also Present: Board of Directors (Board) Chairperson Nate Miley.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS:

Margaret Pearce addressed the Committee regarding personal and public responsibilities to mitigate the impacts of air pollution; to encourage a quickening of the pace of climate action work; to highlight the importance of mitigating air pollution issues as much as possible in new construction; and of taking action to mitigate air pollution as much as possible in every way possible.

NOTED PRESENT: Board Chairperson Miley and Director Pepper were noted present at 9:46 a.m.

Larry Danos addressed the Committee regarding the need for more mitigating efforts particularly during the winter months.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty was noted present at 9:48 a.m.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF DECEMBER 1, 2014

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action:

Director Ross made a motion, seconded by Director Haggerty, to approve the Minutes of December 1, 2014; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Avalos, Barrett, Haggerty, Pepper and Ross.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Adams, Gioia, Kalra, and Zane.

4. UPDATE ON REGIONAL CLIMATE PROTECTION WORK PROGRAM, RULE DEVELOPMENT AND STAFFING

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Abby Young, Principal Environmental Planner of the Planning, Rules and Research Division, who gave the initial staff presentation *Climate Protection Program Update* through slide 12, *Rule Development*, including background; overviews of the Regional Climate Protection Strategy, technical program, local government assistance, and policy approaches.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 4, *Regional Climate Protection Strategy, Sector-based Gap Analysis*, whether any differentiation exists between goals and mandates.

Ms. Young continued the presentation.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 10, *Assist Local Governments*, the meaning of “Focus on fewer, but meaningful, indicators;” what commonalities may exist between local governments; and the Air District’s ability to help local governments with reconciling aspirational goals and implementation realities.

Ms. Young continued the presentation and then introduced Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules and Research, who gave the final staff presentation *Climate Protection Program Update*, including overviews of rule development, staffing resources and next steps.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 12, *Rule Development*, the current level of backup generator use; the impact of permitted generators on future rule development; possible non-combustion alternative energy sources now and in the future; the applicability of the proposed rule to small backup generators commonly used in residences; non-District regulatory framework for smaller backup generators; internet server backup needs; and the evolution of infrastructure analysis relative to building construction and retrofits.

Mr. Hilken continued the presentation.

The Committee and staff discussed, also at slide 12, *Rule Development*, what is expected from the California Air Resources Board (ARB) and when it is expected; clarification that the Air District is not waiting for ARB but working in consultation with an eye to complimenting their program; and Air District staff work to invite a member of ARB’s staff to present to the Board.

Mr. Hilken continued the presentation.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 13, *Staffing Resources*, the urgency of and demand on staff by the rule development schedule.

Mr. Hilken finished the presentation.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the urgency of the need for rule development in the near term and the added and reassigned staff in response to that need.

Public Comments:

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, submitted written material entitled *350 Bay Area Talking Points for BAAQMD Climate Protection Committee January 15, 2015*, and addressed the Committee regarding the accelerating pace of climate change in the last ten years, as well as the enhanced media coverage and scientific analysis.

David Gassman, Greenaction for Health and Environmental Justice, addressed the Committee regarding his being impressed with the staff presentation; to opine on the importance of the Air District making every effort to bring about a change; and to suggest that the Bay Area can do everything right environmentally and have little direct impact but that the example would have a significant impact as an example of good policy.

Steven Nadel, Sunflower Alliance, addressed the Committee regarding emerging studies that suggest it is too late to mitigate climate change because of the damage done and feedback loops that have resulted; to suggest the technology to enable change has been available and the discussion happening for twenty years but without the necessary political will; and to urge staff to expedite all efforts.

Kathy Dervin, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee regarding her expertise relative to the climate; to express her appreciation for the challenges but to urge for immediate action based on what is already known and well established; and to urge for generally stronger and more immediate action.

Tom Griffith, Martinez Environmental Group, addressed the Committee regarding the difference between the gap analysis being discussed and the rule development called for in the Climate Action Work Plan; to suggest the Air District accept the responsibility to address GHGs this year; and to request a revision of permit regulations.

Quanah Brightman, United Native Americans, addressed the Committee regarding the existence of thirteen gasoline-producing refineries in California, five of which are in the Bay Area, and to request that steps be taken to address their methane emissions.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

5. UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA (UC) BERKELEY CARBON DIOXIDE AND AIR QUALITY MONITORING STUDY

Ms. Roggenkamp introduced Professor Ronald C. Cohen, Professor of Chemistry, Professor of Earth and Planetary Science, UC Berkeley, who gave the presentation *Observing CO₂ [Carbon Dioxide] in the Bay Area: Documenting Emissions Changes as They Happen*, including climate, emissions, CO₂ plans, mapping of CO₂ emissions in the Bay Area, an exploration of the number of measurements needed to verify CO₂ emissions from a source or area, an overview of the Berkeley Atmospheric CO₂ Observing Network and the instruments being utilized, and initial air quality measurements data.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the extent and form of the relationship between Berkeley Atmospheric CO₂ Observation Network (BEACON) and the Air District; future monitoring needs and how to show that various mitigation strategies are effective; the enhanced efficacy of a robust monitoring system over voluntary reporting; the meaning and origin of slide 4, *Climate: CO₂ Plans*, item “D. Support Trip Reduction Through Employer-Based Programs; BEACON’s role as one of providing necessary information for policy-makers to make informed decisions; related work in Sacramento and Fresno; the committee and BEACON’s mutual desire to see program expansion eastward along Interstate 580 to Interstate 5, the approximate cost and scale of said expansion, and the viability of an Air District grant in support of the same; whether this discussion will be shared with the Joint Policy Committee (JPC); the absence of Santa Clara County from the map on slide 5, *CO₂ Emissions [tC/yr]*, but not the modeling; the need for an expansion to particular areas of concern in Santa Clara County along with the approximate cost, challenges and the viability of including other emission types, such as methane; further details from slide 18, *BEACO₂N CO₂ 2013*, regarding background levels, large-scale contributions and similarities to measurements in other parts of the world; emissions level differences between weekdays and weekends.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

6. Committee Members’ Comments/Other Business: None.

7. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Thursday, March 19, 2015, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

8. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 11:24 a.m.

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Avalos and Members
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 11, 2015

Re: Air District Climate Protection Program Staffing and Activities

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

In 2005, the Air District Board of Directors adopted a resolution establishing the Climate Protection Program. Since 2005, the Air District has demonstrated leadership in climate protection through its role as a regional convener, funder, technical expert, and regulatory agency. Internally, the Air District has pursued a strategy of integrating climate protection into all agency functions.

In November, 2013, the Air District Board of Directors adopted a resolution establishing a goal of reducing regional greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions 80% below 1990 levels by 2050. The resolution also called on staff to develop a Regional Climate Protection Strategy that will guide and document the Air District's work toward achieving the 2050 GHG reduction goal.

DISCUSSION

Staff will provide the Committee with an overview of the Air District's Climate Protection Program, including key milestones and accomplishments over the past 10 years and current activities. Staff will also provide an update on recent organizational changes intended to provide additional resources to the Climate Protection Program.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION / FINANCIAL IMPACT

Enhanced climate protection activities require additional resources that have been included in the Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2015 budget, with additional resources anticipated in the FYE 2016 budget.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Abby Young
Reviewed by: Henry Hilken

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Avalos and Members
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 11, 2015

Re: Air Resources Board Climate Protection Program

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

In 2006, the California State Legislature passed Assembly Bill 32 (AB 32), the Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006. This Act requires the State of California to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions to 1990 levels by 2020 and to maintain and continue reductions after 2020. AB 32 and calls upon the Air Resources Board (ARB) to develop a strategy for achieving that goal. In response, ARB adopted the AB 32 Scoping Plan in 2008 and updated the Scoping Plan in 2014. The Scoping Plan Update reports that California is on track to meet the state's 2020 GHG target and it is anticipated that these reductions will continue beyond 2020.

California is implementing a broad portfolio of programs to meet the AB 32 goals including energy efficiency, renewable energy, cleaner vehicle programs, and low-carbon fuel requirements. A cornerstone of the Scoping Plan's Strategy to meet the 2020 target is the Cap and Trade program. This program sets a declining cap on emissions from major stationary sources of GHGs in California, including electric power plants, refineries and other large industrial facilities, as well as emissions from the use of natural gas and transportation fuel. Together, these sources are responsible for approximately 85% of all GHG emissions in California. Under the Cap and Trade program, regulated entities are issued a limited number of allowances, representing approximately 90% of the entity's overall GHG emissions level. The percentage of free allowances allocated to each business under the cap declines over time requiring them to either reduce their emissions or to buy allowances at auction or from other entities.

DISCUSSION

Most large stationary sources of GHG emissions in the Bay Area are subject to the Cap and Trade regulation. Air District staff believes that Air District climate protection activities should complement, and be coordinated with, statewide programs. In addition, proceeds from the Cap and Trade allowance auctions are being used to fund a variety of GHG reduction programs being

implemented by different state agencies. Funding and financing opportunities available through these programs are relevant to many regional and local efforts to reduce GHG emissions in the Bay Area.

Edie Chang, Air Resources Board Deputy Executive Officer, will provide the Committee with an overview and update on the ARB's climate protection activities, including the statewide Cap and Trade program.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION / FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Abby Young
Reviewed by: Henry Hilken